

Normalized Scores 45.3

JUDGING CRITERION # 1: LOCAL (0-5)

Does the Proposal/Plan take into account local economic conditions, focusing on existing and potential competitive advantages, in its recommended solutions? Is the Proposal/Plan expected to result in direct economic benefits to the city and its surrounding area? Does the Proposal/Plan identify local assets, economic strengths and weaknesses, and describe how the city can leverage assets and strengths to result in economic benefits?

0 - 1

*Failed to recognize any unique conditions in the City; recommendations could have applied to anywhere...*

1 - 2

*Paid basic attention to general conditions but not based on any specific City need.*

2 - 3

*Recognized local conditions and demonstrated an understanding of the economic climate.*

3 - 4

*Paid attention to specific City needs and focused on targeted economic issues.*

4 - 5

*Grounded by a detailed understanding of the needs of the City and its people.*

4.1 / 5

Score: 4.1

Comment: This proposal does play into the strengths of our city area. It also focuses in on the main industry sectors which line up with the city initiatives. I am not personally familiar with the biofuel industry to relate to the feasibility of this project but the if it does succeed then I can see it bringing economic development to the region.

3.4 / 5

Score: 3.4

Comment: It is a wonderful idea to tap into the area's manufacturing heritage to create a new industry sector - one that would take advantage of our universities and targeted industry clusters, as well as addressing the global sustainable energy demand. While I felt more work needed to be done for the team to understand the facilities, equipment, processes, etc. to make this a reality, it is a worthy concept.

2.5 / 5

Score: 2.5

Comment: The proposed plan is not unique to Greensboro. It doesn't explain why Greensboro is better for this industry than other locations.

3.1 / 5

Score: 3.1

Comment: Recognized local strengths and potential growth. Unsure on a specific plan on how biofuel strategy and implementation would occur with use of funds.

3.2 / 5

Score: 3.2

Comment: Where are the science assets coming from for this proposal? are Gateway? A&T on board with the project? Where will the market for biofuel come from? aviation fuel is very different from automotive - and it is still very early for aviation. what are the cost models in the market for biofuels vs others?

JUDGING CRITERION # 2: FEASIBLE (0-5)

Can the Proposal/Plan yield practical and concrete results in a realistic timeframe that justify the level of required investment, addressing likely obstacles, such as resources available to the city? Does the Proposal/Plan identify economic development strategies that are achievable using existing city resources, or propose ways in which the city can utilize nonexisting/currently unidentified resources to implement these economic development strategies? Does the Proposal/Plan outline a timeline by which the city can develop actionable strategies to implement the ideal contained in the Proposal/Plan?

0 - 1

*Misguided by an optimistic understanding of obstacles and underestimated the effort required to deliver results.*

1 - 2

*Addressed basic obstacles to general recommendations but not with specific or realistic tasks.*

2 - 3

*Demonstrated a realistic and efficient level of effort and attention to detail.*

3 - 4

*Addressed specific obstacles with recommendations tied to detailed, measurable and cost effective tasks.*

4 - 5

*Guided by practical and concrete recommendations; considered timing, funding, return on investment and measurable outcomes.*

2.9 / 5

Score: 2.9

Comment: I believe this proposal does line itself up with the current work force available within the Greensboro area along with ideas or suggestions on how to increase that workforce. This project seemed to be lead by two members. Although they are probably very capable I did not see anything in their background description that lined them up with having experience in the fuel industry. So the question of not knowing what they don't know comes to mind. I would not say that is a major concern, but certainly one to watch out for. Maybe make sure they have someone join the team early that has direct exposure to the bio-fuel industry.

3.4 / 5

Score: 3.4

Comment: Although the proposal needs more concrete descriptions of how a biofuel industry can be launched, the demand, workforce needs and development, utilization of universities' researchers, etc. is worth exploring. I would like to know the basis of the start up investments they recommended. It would also be helpful to know who the main players are now in biofuel industry and to what extent they are meeting the current demand.

2.4 / 5

Score: 2.4

Comment: The proposed plan did not give enough details to explain why this was feasible. It basically just said we ought to look at biofuels.

2.6 / 5

Score: 2.6

Comment: realistic but not concrete in an implantation strategy. I understand that biofuel is the wave of the future but unsure how it could be specifically tied to Greensboro's strengths.

2.7 / 5

Score: 2.7

Comment: timeframe is not clear in the proposal. how long to production? sales? break even? waht are the impacts to the City?

JUDGING CRITERION # 3: INNOVATIVE (0-5)

Is the Proposal/Plan offering a fresh and forward-looking approach that will lead to a clear set of strategically-aligned goals that other economic development initiatives have failed to deliver? Are the ideas and strategies submitted in the Proposal/Plan duplicative of existing plans or strategies being utilized by the city? Does the Proposal/Plan outlay strategies that propose to utilize city resources in more effective and efficient ways to realize the city's economic development goals?

0 - 1

*Promoted style over substance or lacked new and original methods with not enough practical thinking.*

1 - 2

*Raised novel and interesting concepts but failed to tie approach to clear outcomes.*

2 - 3

*Delivered new and different methods with focus on concrete goals and improving outcomes.*

3 - 4

*Raised creative and new ideas that offer a clear roadmap to improved conditions.*

4 - 5

*Introduced ground breaking and advanced thinking that exceeds the promise of any previous approach.*

3.3 / 5

Score: 3.3

Comment: The concept of Bio-Fuel is not a new topic, and it is unclear to me if they have identified anything specific that will make their solution different from any other one. The introduction of bio-fuels in this region may be a newer general concept but not unique to them, as I have heard of others in research and production of bio-fuels in Greensboro. There is probably plenty of room for businesses in this industry and if it goes well I can see it bringing economic development and jobs.

3.4 / 5

Score: 3.4

Comment: there are probably other cities who could implement their plan to start a biofuels industry but this team and Greensboro may have a higher level of desire to make something happen. They are tapping into a trend and integrating it iinto the area's history and culture. My score would be higher if they had used more concrete examples.

2.4 / 5

Score: 2.4

Comment: While biofuels may have potential. No reason was given for why Greensboro is the place for this to happen.

2.8 / 5

Score: 2.8

Comment: Fresh looking but not strategically-aligned. Very little specifics in strategy or implementation.

3.1 / 5

Score: 3.1

Comment: biofuels may hold promise for the city but the plan does not connect biofuel production to economic gains in the city. where/how will workers be trained?